

CHAPTER V

CONCLUSION AND SUGGESTIONS

5.1 Conclusion

There are evidence where the teaching and learning conducted during the COVID-19 pandemic is ineffective. Based on the survey conducted by The Indonesian Child Protection Commission (KPAI), most Indonesian students experience the lack of learning and interactive session with their teachers. The lack of teaching deliverables made UNICEF and World Health Organization warned the learning loss phenomenon to occur in Indonesia. The phenomenon could be described as an evidence of decreased learning ability caused by ineffectiveness of the learning session. Not only it caused a decrease in Indonesia's competitiveness in education globally but in longer term, would cause a decrease value of GDP by learning-loss-experienced labor forces in the next 80 years. Although there have been several studies about teaching effectiveness, there is a research gap in measuring the factors and the study of teachers' resilience on a hybrid learning school setting during the COVID-19 pandemic in Indonesia.

In this study, the three-dimensional framework for resilience as a state was used to analyze the factors that influence Teachers' Resilience to Teaching Effectiveness towards Perceived Learning Loss in hybrid learning setting during the COVID-19 Pandemic. In addition, Computer Self-Efficacy was added as a moderating effect between Teaching Effectiveness towards Perceived Learning Loss. The resilience framework was chosen because the model was constructed by analyzing the perspectives of educators towards changing situations that had occurred in Australia as an overview on their program to promote resilience, which was applicable to the COVID-19 pandemic in Indonesia. The moderating variable was chosen to see the impact of self-efficacy in using technology in the relationship of Teaching Effectiveness to lower Perceived Learning Loss.

The results showed correlation with the phenomenon stated previously, where the implementation of hybrid learning during COVID-19 pandemic with students

from early childhood to secondary level was ineffective. There was indication of low class engagement and low motivation level found through students online. The result confirmed the learning loss phenomenon mentioned and that the higher the level of Teaching Effectiveness lowers the presence of Learning Loss.

Out of the three main variables that influence Teachers' Resilience, only Emotional Competence and Social Competence were found influencing with significant effect. The indicators that significantly build Emotional Competence were emotional regulation, being autonomous, and having sense of humor. The indicators that significantly build Social Competence were good communication, stable relationship, empathy, and kindness. The study also showed a significant influence from Future-Oriented towards Teaching Effectiveness. The indicators that significantly build Future-Oriented were sense of purpose, optimism, flexible and adaptive, and proactive. Another interesting finding shown in the presence of Computer Self-Efficacy in the moderating Teaching Effectiveness towards Perceived Learning Loss where the lower the level of teacher's Computer Self-Efficacy, the stronger the Teaching Effectiveness in reducing Perceived Learning Loss. The low level of Computer Self-Efficacy showed the low level of reliance in using technology in class, that indirectly promotes higher chance of having face-to-face experience, answering the need of real interaction previously mentioned about the learning loss phenomenon.

The result of the confirmatory interviews filled in the gaps of other factors that were not mentioned in the questionnaire. In addition to the indicators of Emotional Competence, there were other factors such as having self-belief and self-acceptance. Next, there were also additional factors in influencing Social Competence, from internal or having relationship with themselves and external or having relationship with others. Additional indicators of being future-oriented were mentioned such as having integrity, growth mindset, nobility, strive for excellence, time management, being discipline, and respectful. The additional factors of effective teaching include supporting infrastructure, supportive human resource management, having common values, effective communication flow, and

supportive parents and students. Aside from building teacher's resilience, the way to achieve learning recovery is to lower teacher's reliance on technology usage. Technology should not replace the teacher's role, but it should support the teachers' role in face-to-face class.

In short, the study was able to fulfil the research purpose, which is to identify and evaluate the factors that influence teachers' resilience to teaching effectiveness. The factors that significantly found influencing teachers' resilience were emotional competence and social competence. At the same time, being future-oriented also influences teaching effectiveness. Thus, teaching effectiveness lowers the perceived learning loss. In the implementation, having computer self-efficacy was mentioned beneficial as it eases the technology integration in hybrid learning. But technology should not replace the teachers' role, rather it should be in the low level so that there is a low amount of technology running the class and promotes more face-to-face experience. The result of the study shown alignment with the learning loss phenomenon that mentioned the need of real interaction. The moderating effect also showed there were other additional factors that influence teaching effectiveness. Additional factors that influence teaching effectiveness and contributed to the success of the hybrid learning implementation were supporting infrastructure, human resource management, shared values, communication flows, as well as parents and student's support. Hence, school management can focus on the implication of factors previously stated as additional supports for an effective teaching, and acceleration of learning recovery.

5.2 Suggestions

Although the implementation of hybrid learning setting during COVID-19 pandemic indicated as an acceptable finding with positive impact, there were several things that can be explored further. To begin with, the questionnaire statements were written in general and theoretical perspective which were prone to confusion for those who are unfamiliar. Confusing statements impact the respondents' understanding level to answer them. Henceforth, future research can

improve the questionnaire statements to promote accurate results and analysis in a professional practice context.

Secondly, the school management played a substantial role in influencing the teachers' hybrid learning implementation. Because of that, future research can consider researching more in the school management factors, especially in decision-making technology management for teaching and learning support. Unless these conditions may not be applicable or relevant, further research can focus on gaining a wider scope of respondents geographically.

In addition, there were several factors that can be explored further based on the teachers' profile. In this study, the respondents included information of their teaching level, number of classes, hybrid learning setting experience duration, Google Educator Certification along with their demographics. The cultural background and additional information provided about the teachers can be further explored to understand how different teaching background and experience affect their effectiveness in teaching.

Subsequently further research may also add additional factors of teachers' wellbeing under changing situations. Continuing research can focus solemnly on the stress level as a variable itself, considering stress level could reduce effectiveness in teaching (Jennings & Greenberg, 2009; as cited in Schussler et al., 2018). Future research can also explore factors that were mentioned from the interviews divided into two aspect, internal aspect (self-belief, self-acceptance, internal social skills) and external aspects (external social skills, schools values and competences, infrastructure, human resource management, sharing values, communication flow, parents and students support).

There are also several managerial implications suggested from this study:

1. The school management as the company stakeholders.
 - a. This research can be used as an input for the company stakeholders to make innovations or managerial strategies related to their teacher's resilience. The school management should consider scheduling face-to-face classes more and

as the COVID-19 pandemic cases number lowers, the school should encourage the students and teachers to come to school.

- b. The school management should consider conducting personal and professional developments that revolve around building emotional and social competences with interesting topics on regulating sense of humor and having optimism. To influence teachers to be future-oriented, the school management should encourage proactiveness. In terms of building resiliency, the professional development topics could start from discussing ways to deal with stress in daily life.
 - c. Teachers are also encouraged to proactively seek their personal development training in regulating emotional and social competence, as well as building awareness of their resiliency.
2. Academics.
- a. This research provides an overview of the information and knowledge to academics. The research brings awareness to include teacher's perspective as research focus in education development as well as personal and professional development.

