Entrepreneurship Education in Hospitality and Tourism: Insights from Graduated Hospitality Students as Entrepreneurs

by Purnamaningsih Purnamaningsih

Entrepreneurship Education in Hospitality and Tourism: Insights from Graduated Hospitality Students as Entrepreneurs

Yoanita Alexandra, Ringkar Situmorang, Purnamaningsih Purnamaningsih

Faculty of Business, Universitas Multimedia Nusantara, 15810 Tangerang, Indonesia
Corresponding Author Email: yoanita.alexandra@umn.ac.id

Abstract
The entrepreneurial education field has expanded alongside the growth of entrepreneurial businesses. Cultivating the entrepreneurial potential of college students also becomes a critical link for social development and innovation. This study further evaluates entrepreneurship courses in hospitality and tourism education. The research participants in this study are graduates of Hospitality Education in Indonesia and currently have an active business in the hospitality industry to manage and operate. The findings found that theoretical and practical hospitality courses, business plan or entrepreneurship courses and interpersonal relationship courses are required to be learned in hospitality education. It also suggested ways to improve hospitality entrepreneurship education by encouraging students to have a strong base of soft skills, providing them with opportunities for creating events and real-life business projects, digital marketing courses and offering internship opportunities. Further, exposure to business life through internships and other extracurricular activities that facilitate the creation of innovative hospitality products was found important.
Keywords: Entrepreneurship, Education, Entrepreneurship Courses, Entrepreneurs, Hospitality Business

Introduction
Governments in both developed and developing countries are primarily concerned with the formation of new businesses (Nowiński et al., 2019). The primary reason is that small and medium-sized businesses promote job opportunities, which can significantly contribute to economic development, economic growth, and community welfare (Tung et al., 2020). However, after the financial crisis in 1997-1998, the number of small-medium enterprises (SMEs) in Indonesia steadily increased (Amalia & Korfesch, 2021). Despite all the positive contributions an entrepreneur can bring, Indonesia still has few entrepreneurs (Abdi et al., 2021). Moreover, entrepreneurs with a high level of education who identify opportunities and

employ technological innovation to create products with high added value represent no more than 3% of Indonesia's overall population (Amalia & Korfesch, 2021). Compared to neighbouring Southeast Asian nations such as Singapore, Malaysia, Thailand, and Vietnam, the percentage is deemed insufficient (Widayati, 2016). However, there are significant increases in hospitality and tourism businesses, such as in the food and beverages industry or lodging businesses. As a result, the entrepreneurial education field has expanded alongside the growth of entrepreneurial businesses (Torrance, et al., 2013).

The education sector, such as campuses and universities, plays an essential role in developing innovative entrepreneurial mind-sets (Secundo et al., 2016). Cultivating the entrepreneurial potential of college students also becomes a critical link for social development and innovation (Ndou et al., 2019). As a result, the Indonesian government proposes several initiatives to increase the number of entrepreneurs by improving entrepreneurial education at all levels of education (Syam et al., 2018; Utomo et al., 2019; Wahidmurni et al., 2019). Tourism has evolved into a significant science that is taught on many campuses and universities all over the world (Malihah et al., 2014). Despite the growing demand for study, several researchers claimed that entrepreneurship education in Indonesian higher education had not been quite effective (Ghina et al., 2017; Larso & Saphiranti, 2016). The ineffectiveness includes a lack of entrepreneurship education programs throughout the country, as well as a lack of understanding of how and what appropriate methodologies to teach and produce graduate entrepreneurs are (Amalia & Korfesch, 2021). Numerous studies have noted that education is essential for developing students' entrepreneurial potential (Sousa et al., 2019; Stamboulis & Barlas, 2014). Despite significant advancements in tourism and hospitality education, the disparity between career and action orientation in education remains a persistent issue (Gurel et al., 2010). The issues raised above justify the need for research into the current state of entrepreneurship education at the Indonesian higher education level.

Recent research on entrepreneurship has led to a dearth of data on the effectiveness of entrepreneurial education in fostering future business owners in Indonesia. Therefore, the perspectives on education for hospitality and tourism entrepreneurs must be studied further. The purpose of this study was to look into the perspectives of hospitality business owners and learn more about their experiences, particularly their educational backgrounds, needs, and opinions regarding entrepreneurship education. This study may give other perspectives and insights on how hospitality education could better serve students looking to pursue hospitality and tourism-related business. Thus, this study explored the following questions:
1.   What academic courses do hospitality entrepreneurs think are crucial for students interested in starting their own businesses in the industry?
2.   How do hospitality entrepreneurs believe entrepreneurship in hospitality and tourism education should be taught?

Literature Review
Entrepreneurship in Hospitality and Tourism
As the popularity of entrepreneurship has grown, so has entrepreneurship education, which typically entails the addition of courses or course components to traditional business curricula (Kuratko, 2006). Hospitality and Tourism programs in higher education usually include practical skills, soft skills, and business knowledge. These are crucial combinations of skills required for graduates who want to work in the hospitality industry (Alexandra & Choirisa,

2021). In teaching entrepreneurship, higher education institutions emphasize developing business plans, even though some scholars argue that they do not constitute an entrepreneurial approach (Maritz et al., 2010).

Entrepreneurship Education

The importance of Entrepreneurship Education is widely acknowledged; however, various challenges for academic institutions remain, including which practical approaches to use, what kind of pedagogical strategies, what outcomes can be expected, and what content should be delivered for effective learning (Kuratko, The Emergence of Entrepreneurship Education: Development, Trends, and Challenges, 2005). Due to the growing number of graduates and the resulting increased competition in the job market, this has become even more important (Ayeh et al., 2022). The objective is to prepare students to learn the fundamental of Entrepreneurship and to assist them in making career decisions (Boubker, Arroud, & Ouajdouni, 2021). Entrepreneurial preparedness is linked to a person's readiness to become an entrepreneur, which is defined as a collection of personal characteristics that distinguish people who are preparing to start a business (Saptono et al., 2020). Individuals should have specific competencies; for example, have the strong ability to observe and analyze their surroundings, as well as be creative and highly productive (Ruiz et al., 2016). A study by Olugbola (2017) stated that the readiness for entrepreneurship is determined by many aspects, such as social, psychological, economic, business, and management. Moreover, higher education in hospitality and tourism is distinctive in its approach to course design and pedagogy. Its ultimate goal is to supply the tourism industry with suitably qualified talents. Educators in the field of hospitality and tourism have argued that it is crucial to give students not only theoretical knowledge but also hands-on experience at both the regional and international levels. (Harianto et al., 2021).

Entrepreneurial education program differs from traditional education; it places a greater emphasis on skills, traits, and behaviours related to creative and critical thinking (Gibb, 2005), adaptive to change, multi-disciplinary thinking, social skills, and intellectual and competitive skills (Ndou et al., 2019). What role does entrepreneurial education play in preparing students to be entrepreneurs? Several studies have agreed that education is a circumstance to prepare students for being entrepreneurs (Bazkiaei et al., 2020; Jena, 2020; Nowinski et al., 2019). Furthermore, besides preparing students to be entrepreneurs, entrepreneurial education can also increase students' intentions and attitudes and improve performance (Barbosa et al., 2008). In addition, Henry et al (2005) asserted that entrepreneurs need three different abilities that distinguish them from the regular employee: technical, business management, and entrepreneurial skills. Technical abilities relate to expression and include the ability to speak, write, and organize effectively. Skills in planning, making decisions, bookkeeping, and managing marketing are essential for success in business. Creative thinking, a willingness to take risks, and tenacity are all traits that may be developed. (Henry, Hill, & Leitch, 2005). Effective entrepreneurship education has been found to help students develop these three broad abilities (Rae, 2006).

Methodology
Design and Approach
This study is an exploratory research project aimed at determining the efficacy of incorporating the entrepreneurship education offered in the Hospitality and Tourism Program at higher learning institutions in Indonesia. The methodological framework for this study uses

qualitative study with an IPA (Interpretative Phenomenological Analysis) approach. IPA's strength as a method for analyzing qualitative data lies in its capacity to dissect and make sense of people's actual experiences (Alase, 2017). Individuals are particularly invited to engage in IPA because they have the ability to provide the researcher with relevant information about the subject of the study. Usually, less than 15 research participants are included (Reid et al., 2005). For this study, semi-structured interviews were chosen because they allowed the researcher to request clarification from interviewees in order to acquire a better understanding of their actions and opinions (Christou, 2006).

Data Collection
The data collection was conducted from April to June 2022. For this study, the research participants were chosen using purposive sampling. Participants in the research are selected on the basis of their characteristics (Richards & Morse, 2002). The interviewees' characteristics for this study are graduates of hospitality major in higher education in Indonesia and are currently active as hospitality and tourism entrepreneurs and still with ongoing experiences with entrepreneurship. The data was gathered from 12 entrepreneurs whose businesses included coffee beans roasters/suppliers, a Sundanese family restaurant, an online cake shop, a café and bistro, an American-Italian restaurant, healthy food/snacks, burger joint and beer house, *Martabak* (Indonesian Pancake) shop, Restaurant, coffee shop, and Food and Beverage consultant.

Data Analysis
The first step in the data analysis was listening to the recordings, followed by the transcription of those recordings. The interviews were conducted in *Bahasa*; thus, translating to English was the next step. The initial step in the processing of the interview data was a transcription, followed by the identification of new topics and themes that emerged from those transcriptions. These transcriptions were then evaluated to develop a method for efficient data coding. The NVIVO software was utilized to manage the data. The insights gained from the participants were put through a thematic analysis so that they could be better understood. The thematic analysis comprises searching over data collection to detect, analyze, and report repeating patterns (Kiger & Varpio, 2020).

Findings and Discussions
Twelves interviewees were varied; most of them operated small culinary businesses with business age is 1-year-old to 20 years old. The interviewees' profiles are provided in Table 1. All entrepreneurs interviewed were prominent hospitality college graduates with degrees in Diploma 3, Bachelor's Degree, and Master's Degree in Hospitality Education. They ranged in age from 23 years old to 49 years of age. Data obtained from the interviews were analyzed for topics related to hospitality education, as well as motivations and challenges in business day-to-day operations. Table 2 presents examples of these educational topics that will be discussed below.

Table 1
Respondents Profile

Initial	Type of Business	Demographic Information	Education level and area of study	Age of business	Number of Employees
AB	Coffee beans suppliers and Roasters	Indonesian, Male, 30 years of age	Master's Degree, Hospitality & Tourism Management and Culinary	3 years	3
BC	Sundanese Family Restaurant	Indonesian, Male, 30	Bachelor's Degree, Hospitality & Tourism Management	20 years	40
CD	Online Cake Shop	Indonesian, Female, 30	Master's Degree, Hospitality & Tourism Management and Culinary	1 year	3
EF	Café and Bistro	Indonesian, Male, 23	Diploma 3, Hotel Operations Program	>1 year	3
FG	American-Italian Restaurant	Indonesian, Female, 30+	Bachelor's Degree, Hospitality & Tourism Management	1 year	24
HI	Healthy Food/Snacks	Indonesian, Female, 29	Master's Degree, Hospitality and Culinary	>2 years	4
JK	Burger Joint and Beer House	Indonesian, Female, 30	Master's Degree, Hospitality and Tourism	5 years	>100
LM	*Martabak* (Indonesian Pancake) Shop	Indonesian, Male, 30+	Master's Degree, Hotel and Tourism Management, Business	6 years	8
NO	Restaurant	Indonesian, Male, 23	Diploma 3, Hotel Operations Program	1 year	
PQ	Coffee Shop	Indonesian, Male, 49	Master's Degree, Culinary and Tourism Management	1 year	5
RS	F&B Production Consultant, Kitchen Contractor, Distributor	Indonesian, Male, 28	Bachelor's Degree, Hospitality	>2 years	5

	and Fabrication				
TU	Coffee Shop, Coffee beans suppliers and Roasters	Indonesian, Female, 22	Diploma 3, Hotel Operations Program	>2 years	20

Topics on education, as well as motivations, rewards, and difficulties concerning the entrepreneur's operational activities, emerged from the analysis of the data gathered through the interviews.

Table 2
Interviewees' Insights examples of hospitality entrepreneurship education

Hospitality Courses for Entrepreneurship	Conceptual Education for Entrepreneurship
• In business planning class, I got an idea of how to start a business; I have to have a clear idea of what the business is and what the background is. I also have to calculate how much the cost is and how much the capital is. • If you want to be an entrepreneur, the basic knowledge of theory is necessary because it shapes you • . • It is called interpersonal relationships. It's good for how to manage people, and how to build trust with clients. So, there are a lot of positive things in that course. That is the only course that I cannot forget until now. • The business plans. We learned from zero how to do business. Even though you are just continuing the business, you just need to put it into the stages of the business plan; you have to manage it by yourself and adjust it to the business we are holding.	• However, the most effective thing is to dive right in. The theory is important, but the experience is also important. • I prefer to start the project right away. Sometimes we make a business plan, but when it is already running, the reality does not match the business plan. Suppose I prefer to just jump right in even if the business plan is still not perfect. Nevertheless, you should know that later from this experience, from the business that you run. • At the very least, know the basics of how to build a business, what the business objectives are, what the background of the product is, why the product is being sold, calculate costs, and calculate the selling price. • When you are doing business, you are forced to commit. That commitment sometimes becomes unequal from one person to another. So, if you want it for earlier students, maybe a bazaar held internally, let us say in the university hall or so. Then, the 'advanced' semester students may be directed with the one I said before, establishing a business.

Hospitality Courses
Despite the wide variations in their educational backgrounds, the entrepreneurs interviewed provided similar recommendations for useful courses and course content that could involve

practical learning for aspiring entrepreneurs. Below are the courses that active entrepreneurs believe it is crucial

1.   Theoretical and Practical Hospitality Courses

The introductory courses in hospitality, especially in practical knowledge such as food production, baking and pastry, and food service, are essential for the hospitality business since it is becoming the core of how they make the products they sell. For example, CD is an active online cake shop entrepreneur; she feels pastry and bakery learned back on campus are very crucial in shaping the basic techniques and daily business operational activities. Further, in theoretical and practical hospitality courses, normally campuses already implement the safe working practice, thus it is crucial as a basic habitual to have for having hospitality-related businesses. JK added,

"Then, I learned K3L (Kesehatan, Keselamatan, Keamanan, dan Lingkungan, similar to Occupational Safety and Health) is related to the business. Because we must buy and prepare the standard equipment for occupational health and safety in commercials levels to be installed in the shops since it is different from the safety standard in a household."

The Occupational Safety and Health Administration (OSHA) was established to protect workers and those who enter the workplace from the dangers of accidents. Improving the health of workers and lowering the risk of occupational diseases and accidents (CAC) is one of the goals of the K3L program, which also aims to enhance the amount of work that can be accomplished in a given amount of time (Purnomo et al., 2018). Several research participants agreed that in hospitality courses, they are not only learning about the techniques or theoretical knowledge, but they also learned the Standard Operating Procedures, safety work practices, cleaning habits, and the most critical things in hospitality management (e.g. kitchen management) in practical terms. RS noted that "*Stuff that is related to management, it can be human resource management, cost control management, risk management, especially restaurant management and kitchen management, and they are crucial since we need to manage our businesses, especially managing the operational kitchen activities.*" The hospitality business possesses several characteristics that combine to produce a unique environment in which management learning can take place. Intangibility, inseparability, and perishability are three characteristics that define the service-based industry, which includes establishments such as hotels, food service, restaurants, bars, and nightclubs (Cooper, Fletcher, Fyall, Gilbert, & Wanhill, 2008). These features require a strategic management approach that is reactive, and that maintains tight proximity to the production and deliveries of goods and services (Bowen & Ford, 2004; Ritchie & Riley, 2004).

2.   Business Plan and Entrepreneurship Courses

Many interviewees emphasize the importance of business courses such as business plan, feasibility study, cost control, finance, and marketing. Business Plans themselves are still recommended by the research participants for guiding the students on how to build a business. Nevertheless, it is suggested that the business is a real-time business, where the students try to make a business plan and make it into reality. One of the interviewees (AB) mentioned that

"If there is money, it is real. If it is just pretending, it is a different feeling because they are not afraid of losing it. If you have already spent 10 million, what do you have to lose? You'll do

everything you can to get your 10 million back. At least, like that. The feeling is different; it cannot be equated."

Spending their own money on a business will give students the feeling of owning it and increase their commitment to it. Studies find that the commitment of business owners is crucial to the longevity of a business (Ezekiel et al., 2018; Cardon & Kirk, 2015); thus, it is important for students to have a sense of commitment to the business.

Moreover, there are some courses that the practitioners feel are significant to learn, but the academic institutions failed to deliver or have never been learned as a course subject in hospitality education. For example, one interviewee (CD) noted that "*What I want to learn more about is probably how to calculate, for example, how to calculate capital, how to calculate ROI (Rate of Investment), how to calculate investment, learn the proper way to calculate cost price, how to calculate selling price*". This has been said even the materials already learned through Cost Control course subject in college study. The interviewee explained that throughout the course, the students only tried to understand how to calculate such things through made-up problems and case studies or, in some cases, mock-up business plans. The problems solved in class were completely different when the practitioners faced real-life financial business problems. This stressed the importance of having a real-time business plan compared to a mock-up business plan. This can be done in the education curriculum by implementing project-based learning. Project-based learning approach has several characteristics, such as students making choices regarding a framework, problems, or challenges; then students building methods to solve problems or difficulties; and students working together to solve problems that arise (Radianto & Wijaya, 2017). Further, based on the previous study in accounting, students may immediately put what they learn about accounting to use through experiencing real businesses. For the same reason, employing project-based learning techniques in a business ethics class can help students grasp the concept of ethics much more rapidly (Radianto, 2013).

3.   Interpersonal Relationship Courses
   Positive interpersonal relationships are associated with a variety of advantages. It has been suggested that healthy interpersonal connections can operate as a barrier against stress and risk, an instrumental help for duties, emotional support in everyday activities, companionship in activities shared, and a base for psychological and social growth (Gutman et al., 2002; Martin et al., 2009). One of the interviewees recalled the importance of Interpersonal Relationship Courses,

"The course is called interpersonal relationships. We learned how to manage people and how to build trust with clients. So there are a lot of positive things in that course. That is the only course that I cannot forget until now. Honestly speaking, how the lecturer brings this course is good. She said that the conclusion of the course is, 'In essence, every human being is related because he has needs.' The intended needs are not just material things. You can get your 'satisfaction feeling' by talking to people, you can get new ideas because sharing with someone, you can get safety assurance when you ask for help."

 Thus, interpersonal relationship courses were critical for students to learn more on campuses. Further, entrepreneurship, which actualizes the attitude and behaviour of

entrepreneurs in the achievement of goals through creative actions, hard work, building value, searching for opportunities, developing relationships with customers, suppliers, workers, and others with limited resources, and calculated risk-taking, is associated with the idea of interpersonal competence in the context of business activity (Abraham & Tupamahu, 2016).

Conceptual Education for Entrepreneurship
All the hospitality entrepreneurs interviewed were prominent hospitality college graduates that have learned one or more subjects related to entrepreneurship. As it happens, it seems that there are many similarities between entrepreneurs' points of view on how entrepreneurship should be taught in Hospitality education. Most entrepreneurs agree that creating a business plan can develop ideas for doing business. Creating a business plan has become a staple experiential learning activity in entrepreneurship classes over the past few decades (Gorman et al., 1997; Kuratko, 2005). A business Plan can open the way of student think of a business since it is analyzed from several perspectives. However, it is preferable that students have hands-on experience, where they are not only creating a plan but also executing the plan in real life. 10 out of 12 participants agreed that entrepreneurship could effectively be learned in the field. Books and the theoretical side of entrepreneurship are also significant as a guide. However, there are many components to learning; thus, it is best learned by experiencing it. One of the interviewees (AB) give an example from E-commerce,

"You can imagine how a company used to open a grocery store, and then suddenly it became e-commerce. E-commerce was never learned on campus (back then), and those companies sell online. You have to check what is going on in the field, so you can maneuver when it is needed."

Given the growth of entrepreneurship and the expressed desire of students to start their firms, educators would benefit from learning more about entrepreneurs in hospitality and tourism, particularly concerning their perspectives on education. The entrepreneurs interviewed indicated a need for coursework in business and communications, attention to risk understanding, a focus on developing creativity and innovation strategies, an emphasis on a tourism community, and a need for practical pre-occupation training. According to the findings of this qualitative study, entrepreneurs see a real need for educational experiences focused on what could be called the practice and concepts of entrepreneurship. Some ideas for the content of entrepreneurial education in hospitality and tourism based on the findings include incorporating the following into the

curriculum. While these suggestions are based on the perspectives of entrepreneurs who operate their businesses in hospitality industries, they could be useful in encouraging students to develop an entrepreneurial mindset that could be applied within corporations or other organizations, thereby preparing students for careers in a variety of ventures.

1.   Soft-Skills Focus Education
One of the essential things that are needed to be stressed the most in hospitality education is the soft-skills. According to the previous study (Kechagias, 2011), soft skills consist of "intrapersonal" and "interpersonal" (socio-emotional) abilities that contribute to personal growth, group participation, and professional success. Three crucial soft skills, including leadership, critical thinking and problem-solving, and communication, have been identified by previous academics (Ngang et al., 2015; Tang, 2020) as necessary for students enrolled in

diploma or bachelor's degree business studies programs. They determined that future business owners will require these three soft talents more than others to deal with business operations and be more competitive.

Moreover, soft-skills courses that can cover how to communicate with people, leadership, networking skills, and negotiation skills were found significant to learn in college by several practitioners. Practitioners agreed that operating hospitality businesses would force business owners to communicate with many people, from customers, employees, prospective clients, investors, and suppliers. Good communication skills must be learned by future entrepreneurs in the hospitality industry. One interviewee also noted the importance of learning about the diversity of people in Indonesia. "*People from West Java, Central Java, Bali, and Medan all work differently; their mentality is different. That is what was supposed to be briefed in the beginning. It means that we also have to open our eyes to differences*." This statement heightened the importance of learning people's behaviour since being an entrepreneur will require one to deal with people and how to get along with situations and circumstances. Further, the interviewee (NO) mentioned that "...*even when we do not have good products and services, recommendations from powerful people can positively impact our business*." Being connected and having good relations with many people are crucial for an entrepreneur.

The interviewees noted the importance of soft-skills focus on hospitality education. One of the most important values needed to be developed by academic institutions is persistence. Entrepreneur demonstrates entrepreneurial persistence when they continue to have a positive attitude toward their entrepreneurial motivation and constantly renew their active engagement in a new business venture. However, there are other, potentially more appealing options available to them (Caliendo et al., 2020). The study by Millán et al (2014) confirmed the presence of persistence in entrepreneurship. Quoting one of the interviewees (JK), "*You also have to be agile and must be able to adapt. Because nothing in this world is certain, everything changes.*" Further, (AB) added,

"*You can have all the knowledge, you can have all the intelligence, for example, you have all the experience in the world, but if you are not constantly working on it, what is the point? It will not be used.*"

Besides persistence, consistency of work is one of the important things for students to value. Moreover, it is important to focus on developing students' attitudes.

"*How to behave, how to react, those kinds of things. Even though hospitality teaches how to always be extra in front of guests, you must learn how to cover and hide your problems. I mean, my problems are my problems; work is work. That is how you become a professional.*"

Students are advised to learn more about professional attitudes and separating personal and work matters. RS then added

"*Being in a service business is not an easy task. We are 'forced' to be fake. If people cannot stand it, it will lead them to stress. Those kinds of things you do not get in the courses.*"

2.   Conducting Event Projects for Students and Real-Life Business Projects

All the entrepreneurs interviewed emphasized the importance of hands-on experience and indicated that working in entrepreneurial environments helped them build the skills and confidence necessary to launch their enterprises. One of the interviewees (RS) stated that trusting students to hold an event project is like giving them a blank canvas. They are forced to think and apply all the knowledge they know to create an event. There are many components to be thoroughly thought about in making events, such as planning for the events, how to communicate with suppliers, clients, vendors, entertainment, and so on. Thus, creating an event may develop students' critical thinking and communication skills. Further, creating a business project or holding an event where the students are the active committee also may help to develop the mentality of an entrepreneur; thus, interpersonal and intrapersonal skills may be improved. One interviewee (AB) notified the importance of creating an event project, not only holding the event, but it must be a profitable event. It is hoped that by holding potentially profitable events, the students will understand more about the business context, which is to make profits. PQ also added,

"University is where you can spend your 'failure quotas'. Fail as many as you can, experience everything, so when you graduate and become an entrepreneur, you are ready for all those mistakes learned in the past."

It is not an easy effort to establish a new firm when an earlier one has failed. It depends on the ability of the entrepreneur to overcome the obstacles brought about by the previous failure of the business (Vidayana et al., 2020).

3.   Digital Marketing Courses

Several interviewees agreed that the shifting of a technological era in business is needed to be further studied in college; one of the courses that needed to be learned is Digital Marketing. The rise of social media has made it possible for businesses to engage with millions of customers about their goods and services, which has opened up new possibilities for selling items and services on the market (Mangold & Faulds, 2009). Digital marketing is the promotion of a brand or business items via the use of any form of digital advertising channels as an alternative that is both more engaging and informative (Omar et al., 2020). One interviewee (FG) noted that,

"Digital Marketing is important... which is another level of today's generation that will enter the industrial era 4.0, so we must learn and be capable in these things, that many transitions from old businesses must follow the development to new businesses, one of which is in the field of marketing."

Social Media and Digital marketing are becoming essential communication tools in almost all business sectors. These technological developments have had a significant impact on tourism since there has been a significantly increased amount of information available online (Cunha et al., 2021). In addition to digital marketing, learning how capturing photographs of hospitality products is also important. One of the interviewees (HI) stated that,

"Photos are assets or investments for social media, websites, and people are sharing anything in this day and age. Especially if something can be captured. Then, when we sell, customers

perceive a brand not by trying it, but by imagining it based on the photograph. Therefore, I believe it will be important to return to digital marketing because everything requires visuals."

As more people prefer to shop online rather than in physical stores, and as more people utilize digital devices as their primary means of shopping, digital marketing initiatives are becoming more effective (Omar et al., 2020).

4.   Offer internships opportunities in the hospitality industries
Internships can be considered independent or voluntary projects undertaken by students to improve their employability, skillsets, or knowledge to advance their careers or meet the demands of the workplace (Lu & Wang, 2018). Students may have the option to gain training in both an academic setting and under the guidance of real-world professionals by participating in an internship. Additionally, internships bridge the gap between the theoretical knowledge gained in college and the experience gained on the job (Lu & Wang, 2018). Research participants (9 out of 12) agreed that internships program in hospitality education is contributed to their entrepreneurial activities. Even though the department in Hotel where they worked is not related to the business they worked in, the internships program helps to shape their mentality as LM said, "*From the internship, the influence is to shape our mentality because during the internship we are mentally trained and prepared to become professionals*." Further, one of the interviewees (BC) stated,

"Whereas when you have an internship experience, you will know how it feels to be an employee, how the operation works, you know the obstacles that you will face when there is day-to-day operation. So that when you want to be an entrepreneur, you would have a picture of the working field."

 However, the company where the students had their internships are crucial. It is suggested by the interviewee (FG) that hospitality student apply their internship program to a more prominent hospitality company (e.g. 4-5-star hotels) since they have more apparent management Standard Operating Procedure that is important for the student to learn for becoming an entrepreneur. Further, PQ stated that the bigger the company, the higher the concern of maintaining quality. This mentality developed during internship may be helpful when they are operating a business later on.

Internships in the hospitality industry are crucial for future entrepreneurs since they shape their mentality and professional work attitude. Working in another company also gives them the big picture of how business works. According to the study, fieldwork experience such as Internships found in the study are critical in the hospitality curriculum (Goeldner & Ritchie, 2012). There is a concern that higher education places an excessive amount of emphasis on academic knowledge while mainly ignoring practical skills and practicum experiences (Chen et al., 2011). It has been hypothesized that college students find it challenging to deal with the demands and pressure of their jobs (Wang, 2002). Thus, an internship helps students familiarize themselves with specific demanding tasks and the pressure of a hospitality business.

5.   Conduct courses, workshops, or extracurricular activities that facilitate the creation of innovative hospitality products

Establishing new business ventures is greatly aided by the excellent standard of education in innovative fields (Ndou et al., 2019). It is also crucial to provide an opportunity for students and faculty to participate in a wide variety of hands-on activities related to the development of their innovative idea for hospitality and tourist products through the offering of such possibilities in classes and workshops. Hospitality products are easy to imitate. Recipes, businesses tips and tricks can easily access through the internet. Thus, one of the challenges that future entrepreneurs may face is the creativity of products. Hospitality Workshops inviting practitioners may inspire students to create innovative products and hospitality businesses.

Conclusion, Limitations, and Further Research

In conclusion, this study found that theoretical and practical hospitality courses, business plan or entrepreneurship courses and interpersonal relationship courses are crucial courses to be learned in hospitality education. It also suggested ways to improve hospitality entrepreneurship education by focusing on encouraging students to have a strong base of soft skills, providing them with opportunities for creating events and real-life business projects, digital marketing courses and offer internships opportunities, and giving them exposure to business life through internships and conducting other extracurricular activities that facilitate the creation of innovative hospitality products. The findings of this study provided education insights for stakeholders such as hospitality and tourism universities, teachers, and practitioners of education to gain a better understanding from an entrepreneur's point of view. It can assist in focusing future research on entrepreneurship education in the hospitality and tourist industries, particularly in the global emphasis on entrepreneurship. This research contributes to a better understanding of the need for entrepreneurial education, particularly in tourism-related firms, although it has limitations. To learn how these themes are implemented in a broader context, quantitative research is suggested, ideally with larger samples. Further, to delve deeper into the role of education in preparing future entrepreneurs' business plans, financial and physical operations, and creative endeavours in the tourism industry. The entrepreneur sample in this research is all college or master's degree educated, which is not the case for every entrepreneur. On the other hand, a sample of entrepreneurs from different groups could not have the same level of education. As a result, they might not reflect on their own experiences or the educational requirements of others in the same way. Thus, to gain a better understanding of the perspectives held by entrepreneurs, further qualitative research might concentrate on business owners from a variety of demographic subgroups and operating in a variety of geographic settings.

References

Abdi, A. N., Utami, C. W., & Vidyanata, D. (2021). Pengaruh Enrepreneurial Education, Personality dan Self-Efficacy Terhadap Minat Berwirausaha. *Jurnal Ekonomi Bisnis dan Kewirausahaan*, Vol.10, No.1, 23-35, http://dx.doi.org/10.26418/jebik.v10i1.44783.

Abraham, F., & Tupamahu, S. (2016). Interpersonal Competence, Entrepreneurial Characteristics as Market Orientation Basis and Micro and Small Enterprises in Start-up Business Phase. *Jurnal Aplikasi Manajemen*, DOI: http://dx.doi.org/10.18202/jam23026332.14.4.01.

Alase, A. (2017). The Interpretative Phenomenological Analysis (IPA): A Guide to a Good Qualitative Research Approach. *International Journal of Education & Literacy Studies*, 5(2): doi:10.7575/aiac.ijels.v.5n.2p.9.

Alexandra, Y., & Choirisa, S. F. (2021). Understanding college students' e-loyalty to online practicum courses in hospitality programmes during Covid-19 . *Journal of Learning Development in Higher Education*, doi: 10.47408/jldhe.vi21.627.

Amalia, R. T., & Korfesch, H. (2021). Entrepreneurship education in Indonesian higher education: mapping literature from the Country's perspective. *Entrepreneurship Education*, 4:291–333, https://doi.org/10.1007/s41959-021-00053-9.

Ayeh, J., Bondzi-Simpson, A., & Baah, N. (2022). Predicting Students' Response to Entrepreneurship in Hospitality and Tourism Education: An Application of the Theory of Planned Behavior. *Journal of Hospitality and Tourism Education*, https://doi.org/10.1080/10963758.2022.2056469.

Barbosa, S., Kickul, J., & Smith, B. (2008). The Road Less Intended: Integrating Entrepreneurial Cognition and Risk in Entrepreneurship Education. *Journal of Enterprising Culture*, 16 (04), 411-439, https://doi.org/10.1142/S0218495808000181.

Bazkiaei, H. A., Heng, L., Khan, N., Saufi, R. B., & Kasim, R. (2020). Do entrepreneurial education and big-five personality traits predict entrepreneurial intention among universities students? *Cogent Business and Management*, 7:1, https://doi.org/10.1080/23311975.2020.1801217.

Boubker, O., Arroud, M., & Ouajdouni, A. (2021). Entrepreneurship education versus management students' entrepreneurial intentions. A PLS-SEM approach. *The International Journal of Management Education*, 19:1; https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ijme.2020.100450.

Bowen, J., & Ford, R. (2004). What experts say about managing hospitality service delivery systems. *International Journal of Contemporary Hospitality Management*, Vol. 16 No. 7, pp. 394-401. https://doi.org/10.1108/09596110410559078.

Caliendo, M., Goethner, M., & Weißenberger, M. (2020). Entrepreneurial persistence beyond survival: Measurement and determinants. *Journal of Small Business Management*, 58(3):617-647, DOI: 10.1080/00472778.2019.1666532.

Cardon, M., & Kirk, C. (2015). Entrepreneurial Passion as Mediator of the Self–Efficacy to Persistence Relationship. *Entrepreneurship Theory and Practice*, 39 (5), https://doi.org/10.1111/etap.120.

Chen, C.-T., Hu, J.-L., Wang, C.-C., & Chen, C.-F. (2011). A Study on the Effects of Internship Experiences on the Behavioral Intentions of College Students Majoring in Leisure Management in Taiwan. *The Journal of Hospitality Leisure Sport and Tourism*, 10(2):61-73, DOI: 10.3794/johlste.102.294.

Christou, E. (2006). A qualitative analysis of consumer attitudes on adoption of online travel services. *Tourism: An International Interdisciplinary Journal*, Vol. 54 No. 4; https://hrcak.srce.hr/161562.

Cooper, C., Fletcher, J., Fyall, A., Gilbert, D., & Wanhill, S. (2008). *Tourism principles and practice.* Harlow, England: Prentice Hall Financial Time.

Cunha, M., Correia, R., & Costa, A. (2021). Digital Marketing in Hospitality – Case Study of Social Networks as a Communication Toll in Oporto Hotels. *Journal of Internet Social Networking and Virtual Communities*, 17: DOI: 10.5171/2021.871699.

Ezekiel O, A., Omotayo, A., & Olaleke O , O. (2018). Entrepreneurs' Commitment and Business Performance in Business Economy. *Academy of Entrepreneurship Journal*, 24 (1).

Ghina, A., Simatupang, T., & Gustomo, A. (2017). The relevancy of graduates' competencies to the effectiveness of entrepreneurship education: A case study at SBM ITB-Indonesia. *Journal of Entrepreneurship Education*, 20(1):1-24.

Gibb, A. (2005). Towards the entrepreneurial university: entrepreneurship education as a lever for change. *Policy Paper*, 3 (2005): 1-46.

Goeldner, C., & Ritchie, J. (2012). *Tourism: principles, practices, philosophies*. Hoboken, N.J.: John Wiley and Sons, Inc.

Gorman, G., Hanlon, D., & King, W. (1997). Some Research Perspectives on Entrepreneurship Education, Enterprise Education and Education for Small Business Management: A Ten-Year Literature Review. *International Small Business Journal: Researching Entrepreneurship*, 15 (3), 56-77, https://doi.org/10.1177/0266242697153004.

Gurel, E., Altinay, L., & Daniele, R. (2010). Tourism students' entrepreneurial intentions. *Annals of Tourism Research*, 37(3): 646-669, https://doi.org/10.1016/j.annals.2009.12.003.

Gutman, L. M., Sameroff, A., & Eccles, J. (2002). The Academic Achievement of African American Students During Early Adolescence: An Examination of Multiple Risk, Promotive, and Protective Factors. *American Journal of Community Psychology*, 30, 367–399, https://doi.org/10.1023/A:1015389103911.

Harianto, A., Situmorang, R., Alexandra, Y., & Ardani, E. G. (2021). Student Perspective on Practical Learning Method in Pandemic of COVID-19. *ADI International Conference Series, Incogite 2021*, 3(2), 432-442; https://doi.org/10.34306/conferenceseries.v3i2.611.

Henry, C., Hill, F., & Leitch, C. (2005). Entrepreneurship education and training: can entrepreneurship be taught? Part I. *Education + Training*, Vol. 47 No. 2, pp. 98-111, https://doi.org/10.1108/00400910510586524.

Jena, R. (2020). Measuring the impact of business management Student's attitude towards entrepreneurship education on entrepreneurial intention: A case study. *Computers in Human Behavior*, 107, https://doi.org/10.1016/j.chb.2020.106275.

Kechagias, K. (2011). Teaching and assessing soft skills. *Neapolis: MASS Project report*.

Kiger, M., & Varpio, L. (2020). Thematic analysis of qualitative data: AMEE Guide. *Medical Teacher*, DOI: 10.1080/0142159X.2020.1755030.

Kuratko, D. (2005). The Emergence of Entrepreneurship Education: Development, Trends, and Challenges. *Entrepreneurship Theory and Practice*, 29 (5), 577-597, https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1540-6520.2005.00099.x.

Kuratko, D. (2005). The Emergence of Entrepreneurship Education: Development, Trends, and Challenges. *Entrepreneurship Theory and Practice*, 29 (5), https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1540-6520.2005.00099.x.

Kuratko, D. F. (2006). A Tribute to 50 Years of Excellence in Entrepreneurship and Small Business. *Journal of Small Business Management*, 44(3):483 - 492. doi:10.1111/j.1540-627X.2006.00185.x.

Larso, D., & Saphiranti, D. (2016). The Role of Creative Courses in Entrepreneurship Education: A Case Study in Indonesia. *International Journal of Business*, 21 (3), 216-225.

Lu, H., & Wang, Y. (2018). Entrepreneurial Learning Acquired Through Internships in the Hospitality Industry. *KnE Social Sciences*, 3(10), DOI: 10.18502/kss.v3i10.3486.

Lu, H., & Wang, Y.-C. (2018). Entrepreneurial Learning Acquired Through. *The 2018 International Conference of Organizational Innovation, KnE Social Sciences*, 1487–1499. DOI 10.18502/kss.v3i10.3486.

Malihah, E., Puspito, H., & Setiyorini, H. D. (2014). Tourism Education and Edu-Tourism Development: Sustainable Tourism Development Perspective in Education 1. *Eco-Resort and Destination Sustainability: Planning, Impact, and Development*, Paper Presented at the 1st International Seminar on Tourism (ISOT), Bandung 27 - 28 October 2014.

Mangold, W., & Faulds, D. (2009). Social media: The new hybrid element of the promotion mix. *Business Horizons*, 52 (4), 357-365, https://doi.org/10.1016/j.bushor.2009.03.002.

Maritz, A., Brown, C., & Shieh, C.-J. (2010). A blended learning approach to entrepreneurship education. *Actual Problems of Economics*, 13(115), 83–93. International Conference of Organizational Innovation (2010 ICOI), Bangkok, Thailand, 04-06 August 2010.

Martin, A., Marsh, H., McInerney, D., & Green, J. (2009). Young people's interpersonal relationships and academic and nonacademic outcomes: Scoping the relative salience of teachers, parents, same-sex peers, and opposite-sex peers. *Teachers College Record*, http://www.tcrecord.org.

Millán, J. M., Congregado, E., & Román, C. (2014). Persistence in entrepreneurship and its implications for the European entrepreneurial promotion policy. *Journal of Policy Modeling*, 36(1):83–106, DOI: 10.1016/j.jpolmod.2013.10.001.

Ndou, V., Mele, G., & Del Vecchio, P. (2019). Entrepreneurship education in tourism: An investigation among European Universities. *Journal of Hospitality, Leisure, Sport & Tourism Education*, Vol. 25, https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jhlste.2018.10.003.

Ngang, T. K., Mohamed, S. H., & Kanokorn, S. (2015). Soft Skills Of Leaders And School Improvement In High. *Social and Behavioral Sciences*, 191, 2127-2131. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.sbspro.2015.04.652 .

Nowinski, W., Haddoud, M. Y., Lancaric, D., Egerova, D., & Czegledi, C. (2019). The impact of entrepreneurship education, entrepreneurial self-efficacy and gender on entrepreneurial intentions of university students in the Visegrad countries. *Studies in Higher Education*, 44 (361-379), https://doi.org/10.1080/03075079.2017.1365359.

Olugbola, S. (2017). Exploring entrepreneurial readiness of youth and startup success components: Entrepreneurship training as a moderator. *Journal of Innovation and Knowledge*, 2 (3), 155-171, https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jik.2016.12.004.

Omar, F. I., Zan, U. S., & Ibrahim, N. H. (2020). Digital Marketing: An Influence towards Business Performance among Entrepreneurs of Small and Medium Enterprises. *International Journal of Academic Research in Business and Social Sciences*, DOI: 10.6007/IJARBSS/v10-i9/7709.

Purnomo, D., Indasah, I., & Melda, B. (2018). Analysis of Implementation Safety and Health Occupational Management System in Kertosono General Hospital. *Journal for Quality in Public Health*, 1 (2); 78-85.

Radianto, W. (2013). Dampak Pengajaran Etika pada Mahasiswa Program Studi Akuntansi melalui metode Accounting Active. *Prosiding Perkembangan Kewirausahaan dan Tantangannya dalam Menghadapi Perekonomian Indonesia*, Universitas Kristen Maranatha, 19-20 Juni 2013.

Radianto, W., & Wijaya, O. Y. (2017). Project Based Learning and Innovation in Entrepreneurship Education. *International Journal of Applied Business and Economic Research*, 15 (25).

Rae, D. (2006). Entrepreneurial learning: A conceptual framework for technology-based enterprise. *Technology Analysis & Strategic Management* , 39-56, https://doi.org/10.1080/09537320500520494.

Reid, K., Flowers, P., & Larkin, M. (2005). Exploring lived experience: An Introduction to interpretative phenomenological analysis. *The Psychologisy*, 18(1), 20-23.

Richards, L., & Morse, J. (2002). *Read me first for a user's guide to qualitative research (2nd ed)*. London: Sage Publications.

Ritchie, B., & Riley, M. (2004). The role of the multi-unit manager within the strategy and structure relationship; evidence from the unexpected. *International Journal of Hospitality Management*, 145-161, https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ijhm.2003.10.001.

Ruiz, J., Soriano, D. R., & Coduras, A. (2016). Challenges in measuring readiness for entrepreneurship. *Management Decision*, Vol. 54 No. 5, pp. 1022-1046, https://doi.org/10.1108/MD-07-2014-0493.

Saptono, A., Wibowo, A., Narmaditya, B. S., Karyaningsih, R., & Yanto, H. (2020). Does entrepreneurial education matter for Indonesian students' entrepreneurial preparation: The mediating role of entrepreneurial mindset and knowledge. *Cogent education*, 7:1, 1836728, doi: 10.1080/2331186X.2020.1836728.

Secundo, G., Ndou, V., & Del Vecchio, P. (2016). Challenges for Instilling Entrepreneurial Mindset in Scientists and Engineers: What Works in European Universities? *International Journal of Innovation and Technology Management*, 13(05), https://doi.org/10.1142/S0219877016400125.

Sousa, M., Carmo, M., Gonçalves, A., Cruz, R., & Martins, J. (2019). Creating knowledge and entrepreneurial capacity for HE students with digital education methodologies: Differences in the perceptions of students and entrepreneurs. *Journal of Business Research*, 94: 227-240, https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jbusres.2018.02.005.

Stamboulis, Y., & Barlas, A. (2014). Entrepreneurship education impact on student attitudes. *The International Journal of Management Education*, 12(3): 365-373, https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ijme.2014.07.001.

Syam, H., Akib, H., Patonangi, A., & Guntur, M. (2018). Principal Entrepreneurship Competence Based on Creativity and Innovation in the Context of Learning Organizations in Indonesia. *Journal of Entrepreneurship Education*, 21(3), 1–13.

Tang, K. N. (2020). The importance of soft skills acquisition by teachers in higher education institutions. *Kasetsart Journal of Social Sciences*, 41 (1), https://doi.org/10.1016/j.kjss.2018.01.002 .

Torrance, W., Rauch, J., Aulet, W., Blum, L., Burke, B., D'Ambrosio, T., . . . Zurbuchen, T. (2013). Entrepreneurship Education Comes of Age on Campus: The Challenges and Rewards of Bringing Entrepreneurship to Higher Education. *Ewing Marion Kauffman Research Paper*, http://dx.doi.org/10.2139/ssrn.2307987.

Tung, D., Hung, N., Phuong, N., Loan, N., & Chong, S.-C. (2020). The International Journal of Management Education Enterprise development from students: The case of universities in Vietnam and the Philippines. *The International Journal of Management Education*, 18, https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ijme.2019.100333.

Utomo, H., Priyanto, S., Suharti, L., & Sasongko, G. (2019). Developing social entrepreneurship: A study of community perception in Indonesia. *Entrepreneurship and Sustainability Issues*, 7(1), 233-246, doi: 10.9770/jesi.2019.7.1(18).

Vidayana, Burhanudin, & Adiningrum, T. (2020). The role of entrepreneur's experience, age, and education, on re-entry after business failure: a path analysis. *Academy of Entrepreneurship Journa*, 26 (4).

Wahidmurni, W., Nur, M., Abdussakir, A., Mulyadi, M., & Baharuddin, B. (2019). Curriculum development design of entrepreneurship education: a case study on Indonesian higher

education producing most startup founder. *Journal of Entrepreneurship Education*, 22 (3). pp. 1-14.

Wang, Y. (2002). Evolution of higher education in hospitality in Taiwan. *Journal of Human Ecology and Technology*, 3(4), 453-464.

Widayati, R. (2016). *Menangkan MEA, Jokowi: RI Perlu 5,8 Juta Pengusaha Muda Baru*. Retrieved from Tempo.co:https://bisnis.tempo.co/read/773404/menangkan-mea-jokowi-ri-perlu-58-juta-pengusaha-muda-baru

Entrepreneurship Education in Hospitality and Tourism: Insights from Graduated Hospitality Students as Entrepreneurs